

Crime Prevention and Policing Service Model Review

The Province of Prince Edward Island
Public Safety Division
PHASE TWO

perivale + taylor consulting

December 2016

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	1
1 Introduction	2
2 Executive Summary	3
3 Phase 2 Findings	4
3.1 Foundational Objectives	4
3.2 Timeframe and Process	6
4 Recommendation	7
5 Change Plan	8
Appendices	
A Review of the focus models	10
A.1 Territorial Model	
A.2 Newfoundland Model	
B Briefing Paper	16
C Pensions	22

1 **Introduction**

In September, 2015, the Department of Justice and Public Safety received its mandate from the Premier, Hon. H. Wade MacLauchlan, which included the following directive:

“...to find options for cohesive, integrated and efficient public safety services. Policing, fire and other public safety services provide security to citizens from threats to their personal and economic stability.”

The *Crime Prevention and Policing Model Review* (the *Review*) was initiated as part of that mandate and conducted by Perivale and Taylor Consulting Inc. (*perivale + taylor*). The *Report* of the review was presented to Cabinet on July 26th 2016.

The *Report* recommended a strategic, Island-wide concept for the delivery of policing and public safety services: local policing supported by specialized regional or centralized functions, forming part of the *safety and security web*. The *Report* identified six police organizational models, all extant in Canada, which are compared to the Island-wide concept considering cohesion, integration, and efficiency. The models were described in detail in the *Report*.

The Public Safety Division was directed to conduct further research and examination of two of the models, the 'Territorial' and the 'Newfoundland'. The summary of findings in the appendix of this report reflects this direction to *perivale+taylor* from the Cabinet. The model names reflect the current policing arrangements in Yukon Territory and the Province of Newfoundland and Labrador.

In essence,

Yukon Territory is policed by RCMP "M" Division, the only police agency in the Territory, comprising 130 officers. Municipalities are not recognized in the Territorial Police Service Agreement and services are provided to the Territory as a whole.

Newfoundland and Labrador has two provincial police services, the contracted RCMP "B" Division providing services to rural areas under the Provincial Police Services Agreement, and the Royal Newfoundland Constabulary providing services to three non-contiguous urban areas.

The Territorial model is subject to two essential elements: the capacity of the RCMP to provide the human resources and infrastructure support, and the 'absorption' of the existing municipal police staff.

The Newfoundland model requires the establishment of a provincial service or an amalgamated municipal service, and the standardization of policies and procedures to support shared services and integrated teams to provide quality policing services for all Islanders.

2 Executive Summary

As detailed in the *Report* of Phase 1, based upon comprehensive and inclusive input from stakeholders, it is apparent that the current model of delivering policing services is inadequate and presents risk for Islanders and police officers. The absence of cohesion, integration, and efficiency means that Islanders do not receive equitable quality service. However, it was evident in the Phase 1 interviews that there is a strong will to change, albeit not universal.

In Phase 2, the *Review* conducted a series of interviews in jurisdictions experienced in the Territorial and the Newfoundland models, along with site visits, document review, and additional research to provide closer examination of these focus models.

In the course of this process, a better understanding evolved that some fundamental objectives of policing are more foundational than defining a specific model option. The opportunity to achieve these foundational objectives building on the existing context by capitalizing upon resident skills and experience of current personnel provides an opportunity to move forward. The subsequent degree of collective success in implementing these fundamental objectives will affect the future direction by the Minister of Justice and Public Safety on the final organizational model.

The vision is to create a cohesive, integrated and efficient policing service for all Islanders. The process of change from the *status quo* to a new ideal should create certainty and reduce risk for the Province. Parallel to this is the goal to facilitate a transition which is cognizant of personnel welfare and which optimizes the considerable experience and skills of current sworn and civilian staff.

Consequently, it is proposed to commence a process to delineate, develop, and implement the application of these fundamental objectives to change policing practices in support of cohesive, integrated, and efficient policing services. The precursor to the development of such a service is the provincial standardization and the definition of the oversight, management, administration, and service expectations of any PEI police agency.

3 Phase 2 Findings

Following the assessment by the Phase 1 *Review* and two earlier reports on weaknesses and vulnerabilities of the current system, and the current *Review* report revealing that these remain, the *status quo* can be considered inadequate to support a cohesive, integrated and efficient policing service for all Islanders. The establishment of such policing services is the foundational objective. The *status quo* also creates risks to the public and police officers.

It is important that Islanders understand that the purpose of this, Phase 2, initiative is to:

- ensure quality policing services are delivered to all Islanders regardless of police agency
- create Island-wide cohesive, integrated, and efficient policing services
- increase job satisfaction for Island police officers
- enhance officer safety

The opportunity exists to introduce appropriate provincial policing standards and to orchestrate police services and resources to develop and introduce enhancements such that services address foundational objectives of Island policing

3.1 Foundational Objectives

Based on the premise of Island-wide quality policing services for all Islanders, and a cohesive, integrated, and efficient service, the *Review* determined that a number of common approaches across the Island police agencies would facilitate the process moving forward, regardless of organizational model.

There are a number of core areas where commonalities are essential for best practices to occur:

- *An Island Operations Communication System (OCS)* for all police services including common CAD and RMS (computer-aided dispatch CIIDS and records management system PROS). Without the common OCS, police are unable to communicate effectively. The current RCMP OCC, connected to and backed up by OCCs in New Brunswick and Nova Scotia, can absorb the call-load of Charlottetown and Summerside Police Services subject to some staffing adjustments. Kensington PS has used the RCMP OCC since March 2016. This will facilitate the essential interoperability of communications services.
- *Common Records Management Systems* provide Island-wide crime and incident data enabling accurate reporting and Island-wide crime analyses and criminal intelligence gathering.

- *Major Case Management* is a national best practice and is required by legislation in jurisdictions such as Ontario.¹ The approach requires the police to deploy a trained and certified team and front-end load the investigation to:
 - capture perishable evidence
 - interview suspects and witnesses
 - conduct immediate follow-up on alibis and statements
 - process the crime scene

This process requires a critical mass of suitably-qualified² and experienced investigators, including a Commander, Lead Investigator, Analyst, and File Manager, plus a team of dedicated investigators.

Such a common set of criteria for effective investigation will reduce the risk of inadequate investigation and provide the foundation for Island-wide major crime management, including homicide, attempted homicide, serious assaults, sexual assaults, and forensics.

- *National security clearances* to a common and nationally accepted level will facilitate universal access to select data bases and remove barriers to cross agency assistance and participation in combined units. The *Review* was advised that CSIS can be contracted to conduct such clearances.
- *Police canine services* can be delivered more efficiently and cost effectively through a regional approach regardless of the agency.

These services and issues present the most important areas to address the current vulnerability of Island policing. Other universal, yet less essential, strategies such as Combined Traffic Enforcement; selective integrated management and administration, and standardized officer and vehicle equipment, and even integrated patrol, can be introduced relatively easily as time and resources permit.

Expanded enhanced standardization, permanent combined teams, joint forces operations and other services drawing from all agencies should be pursued in a timely manner as appropriate. The essential precursor to cohesive, integrated, and efficient policing services is a common provincial standard which describes the performance expectations of police agencies.

¹ Police Services Act, Ontario Regulation 354/04 Major Case Management

² The Canadian Police College provides training and certification in these areas

3.2 Timeframe and Process

Timing

- These initial core objectives could be implemented in a 12-18 month timeframe.
- As soon as practicable, develop and introduce provincial standards to precede each of the initial core initiatives.
- As a core requirement to ensure system wide security, the security-clearance process can be conducted by contractors (CSIS) familiar with the policing field. This would afford system-wide access to common data, access to facilities, and cross-participation in integrated teams.
- Establishment of Island-wide investigative teams along with Major Case Management can be completed in a timely manner as the trained and certified resources already exist and can be reorganized to support an Island-wide unit.
- Scheduling of canine services to support regional coverage can be accomplished easily given current trained and certified resources.
- The common OCC will require the restructuring of the current Charlottetown PS and Summerside PS call receipt and dispatch functions. This initiative will take longer than other core programs and requires strategic planning, facility adaptations, staff training and separate costing.

Process

- Under this approach, Provincial and Local government commitment to delivering integrated, cohesive and efficient policing services to all Islanders is essential and necessary for success. It can be expected that criticism may be directed to this approach from vested entities. It is important to convey consistent and ongoing commitment to achieving this mandated objective, and to enhance the safety of the public and police officers. The need for change and the inevitability of change must be underscored to participating police agencies, and to the general public.
- The process must be driven, facilitated and, at times, mediated by the Ministry.
- A project Implementation Committee comprised of agency representatives and the Ministry will serve as a coordinating body.
- Regardless of which policing option is selected, it will be important to prepare a detailed implementation plan. This will promote the project's success and acceptance by all affected stakeholders. The implementation plan will help to ensure the change initiative is implemented as smoothly as possible, by proactively identifying the following factors:
 - the rationale for the change, and the goals and objectives as set out in the comprehensive change plan as directed by the Minister

- the roles and responsibilities of the various parties who are participating in the implementation process
 - the implementation project's milestones and timelines
 - strategies for monitoring and evaluating successful implementation of the project
 - a communications plan that provides timely progress reports to police, the public, other affected agencies, and elected officials
 - potential barriers and the appropriate strategies for overcoming those barriers are identified and put in place.
- Appropriate resources, the equivalent to two, and later one, FTE, should be assigned to assist the Ministry in the facilitation of the change plan.
 - A 'champion', encouraging and guiding parties toward transition, along with solid project management is essential.
 - Periodic updates to the Government will monitor progress and assess progressive completion to schedule and determine if, and when, a decision should be made regarding the identification and adoption of future appropriate police model.
 - The Ministry must decide upon the issues of leverage to ensure compliance from agencies and the type of short and long term funding of policing services and the change process.

4 Recommendation

The *Review* recommends development of a comprehensive change and implementation plan which:

- identifies and develops the required provincial policing standards
- provides a directive for the establishment of an Implementation Committee
- provides for the Ministry, resources to facilitate the necessary consultation with relevant stakeholders and orchestrate police resources to meet those standards.

5 Change planning for the policing models - Summary

5.1 Create urgency to address need

A sense of urgency is created by Phase 1 involvement along with ministerial participation in the process. The urgency to make a decision about which policing model will be pursued to change PEI's policing strategy has already been largely instilled with the knowledge amongst most stakeholders and individuals that change is needed and change is afoot.

5.2 Establish coalitions

In the course of the Phase 1 work, it was apparent that select stakeholders, but not all, were prepared to participate in the change process. The Police Association members were supportive of change. It is important to sustain the support of these stakeholders by taking steps such as acknowledging their early support and engaging with them as the process moves forward.

5.3 Create a vision for change

The vision is partly created both in reality and in the minds of participants. The next part is to translate that vision to a comprehensive change plan. This will make tangible the notions of some of the stakeholders.

5.4 The determination, evaluation and selection of the strategic options

The selection of the change steps is influenced by the ease of completion and setting the right tone of inevitability. The smaller, easier tasks establish a sense of early change, the more macro-level initiatives and subsequent successes create a sense of inevitability and a sense of 'no turning back'.

5.5 Communication of the vision

The stakeholders have to be in touch with the status of the project. This will build momentum and begin to signal the inevitability. Communication would be agency-based and include public communication. The Ministry champions should be engaged in promoting and advocating the plan and its successes.

5.6 Identifying and removing obstacles

As there will, inevitably, be resistors and hurdles to the process, the change team should monitor progress, maintain channels of communications and act with immediacy to address challenges.

5.7 Create and capitalising on short-term wins

Identify potential early wins, report those, publicize successes, and use those as a base for next steps.

5.8 Building on the change, using the wave of change that is occurring

Build momentum by cross referencing to other aspects of the plan, underscoring the breadth of the plan and emphasizing those aspects which are perceived as acceptable and successful.

5.9 Solidifying the changes in corporate culture

Anchor completed aspects of the plan in everyday work routines, encourage timely implementation and adoption as 'the way we do things now'.

5.10 Assessing progress and adjusting the plan

Continually monitor, feeling the pulse of the plan and the participants, adjust where/when necessary.

Appendix A The Review of the focus models

A.1 Territorial Model - Contracted

The model is feasible and provides a cohesive, integrated model for rural and urban policing. Policies, standards, procedures, data systems, and telecommunications will be standardized to ensure consistency across the Island and easier transition. Mutual aid from New Brunswick will create a seamless, system.

The *Review* was advised that Public Safety Canada and the RCMP have concerns over the capacity of the RCMP to accept more policing responsibilities in contract jurisdictions at this time. It is understood that the RCMP Depot Division will graduate 40 Troops per year from this point, up from the current 32; this should restore the staffing capacity within four years.

A.1.1 Implementation

(i) Absorption of Municipal Police

The *Review* was advised that the 'general absorption' principle whereby the municipal police from Moncton and Dieppe police departments were absorbed into the Codiac Regional RCMP Detachment may no longer apply.³ It is understood that the RCMP *Lateral Entry* process would apply and the applicants would require background security clearances. The process would include a short period of training at RCMP Depot Division in Regina. Discussions would be required concerning RCMP ranks for municipal officers.

(ii) Pension Adjustments

The *Review* examined the plan rules for the Royal Canadian Mounted Police Pension Plan (the RCMP Plan), the Prince Edward Island Civil Superannuation Fund (the PEI Fund), the Town of Kensington Registered Retirement Savings Plan (the Kensington RRSP), the City of Summerside Employees' Pension Plan (the Summerside Plan), and the City of Charlottetown Superannuation Plan (the Charlottetown Plan). The *Review* looked at the Lifetime Pension Benefit Calculations of the various plans. A summary of the plan rules is included in Appendix A.

If the pension plans for municipal police officers currently participating in the three municipal plans are to be transferred to the RCMP Plan, there will be a number of considerations including:

- Negotiating pension transfer agreements between the various pension plans
- Funding any unfunded pension liabilities prior to the transfer as determined by an actuarial evaluation
- Determining the cost implications to the municipalities for differences as a result of indexing, contribution rates, bridge and other benefits
- Determining how best to approach the Kensington RRSP Plan and the cost implications to the Town of Kensington of a defined benefit pension plan
- Assisting the impacted employees in understanding any difference between the plans and the impact on them personally. This will involve the use of pension experts. For example:

³All but three of the police staff were absorbed into the RCMP

- There may be situations where the acquired pension credits as a result of a transfer may not be equivalent to the exporting employer's pension credits especially if the benefit formula is lower. The reverse may also be true.
- There are differences as to when an employee can collect an unreduced pension.
- There are differences in indexing, contribution rates, bridging and other benefits including whether the benefit is guaranteed or dependent on the funding available in the plan.
- There may be differences in the pension amounts at retirement because the multiplying factors differ between the plans.
- Differences in the plan rules may impact some employees to a greater extent than others based on career earnings and years of service.

(iii) New Entrant Status - Costs

The Review understands, under the federal *New Entrants' Policy*, if a municipality enters into RCMP contract policing, without previously having been policed by the RCMP through an agreement with the federal government, it may have to pay 100% of the costs, as opposed to 90% or 70% as applies to current municipal police service agreements.⁴

The proposed model would be unique in Canadian provinces and consequently there are no precedents, but it is noted the original 100% funding for the Codiac Regional Police Service Agreement (described above) was changed to 90-10% with the 2012 agreement. The PEI cost sharing will be a matter of negotiation between the province and the federal government.

(iv) Facilities

The RCMP Division HQ building in Charlottetown is scheduled for replacement. There is the opportunity for economies of scale by developing a joint facility for the Division, the Charlottetown Detachment, and the Queens Detachment. Currently, there are three separate police facilities in Charlottetown. It is noted that the deployment model may change to reflect a more suitable deployment model in keeping with the new organization chart. For example, the new Charlottetown Detachment may include the contiguous municipalities. Stratford may also be configured into the facilities plan.

(v) Role of Atlantic Police Academy (APA)

Although located in PEI, the local graduations from the APA police studies program comprise only a small percentage of the total Atlantic provinces graduate.

The APA may be able to perform a decentralized in-service training function for the RCMP and for the Island policing agencies.

⁴The Review was unable to obtain a valid copy of the current New Entrant's Policy. A request was made for a copy but the policy has not yet been received

(vi) Change Plan

The implementation will require a four-year time frame, during which time the following standardizations, essential in all plans for moving forward, will be completed:

- security clearances
- common Island-wide OCC, CAD, RMS
- pension plan transition
- building plans

(vii) Provincial Management

The current process would continue, the Commanding Officer reporting to the Minister under the modified PPSA. It is envisioned that the equivalent of one FTE and expert advice as required for the implementation process.

A.1.1 Findings

Should the Government desire to migrate to the Territorial Model the following could be contemplated and proposed outcomes would be realized,

- All policing could fall under the provincial police and be responsible to the Minister. Depending on the governance model, the PPSA may require amendment to enable the Commanding Officer to report to the PEI Police Board, or failing this, the Minister could establish a Public Safety Advisory Board.⁵
- Island-wide Standards could apply to all policing functions.
- There is connectivity between federal, provincial, and municipal policing.
- Mutual aid from RCMP 'J' Division, New Brunswick, and interoperability of Atlantic data and communication systems and operational protocols are in place.
- Management, administration, cost and operations of the Divisional RCMP are conducted in line with parameters dictated by the PPSA.

A.2 Integrated Newfoundland Model

The model is feasible and provides the potential for a cohesive, integrated model for rural and urban policing. Policies, standards, procedures, data systems, and telecommunications will need to be developed and introduced to ensure consistency across the Island agencies. Specific infrequently-used specialized policing functions (such as polygraph and explosives) and mutual aid will be available from contiguous RCMP divisions or other provinces would also be cohesive. For ease of transition, existing municipal-provincial policing boundaries should remain.

⁵The Codiac Regional RCMP serving three municipalities in New Brunswick reports to the Codiac Regional Police Authority and the RPSA is worded accordingly

A.1.2 Implementation

(i) Employment Status of Municipal Police

The jurisdictional boundaries and staffing of the agencies are likely to remain, consequently there is limited need to consider absorption of municipal personnel, as there is in the Territorial model. The risk associated with capacity is, therefore, reduced.

With the requirement for national-level security clearances for all personnel who will require access to facilities, data and systems, there is a risk that some staff may not pass the higher-level clearance. As a consequence, a two-tier status would arise with some staff having restricted access, thus limiting opportunities for participation in activities which require **higher-level clearance**. However, this is balanced with the need to ensure that all Island personnel, with the special status and powers afforded police officers, are security cleared to an adequate level.

The Newfoundland model may call for the employment of currently-municipal police personnel by the province. If this tack is taken by the Government of PEI, (rather than, for example, the continued engagement of separate municipal services or the formation of a regional police service, see models in Phase 1) then there will be wholesale readjustment of employment arrangements along with a realignment of funding of services.

However, considering the Victoria-Esquimalt police departments example, where two municipal agencies were amalgamated by a Ministerial Order, the employment status may remain municipal.⁶

Changes in the configuration of policing boundaries and responsibilities may impact the RCMP in one of two ways. An increase in policing responsibilities may be limited by current capacity of the RCMP. Alternatively, reduction in responsibilities may mean that a critical mass is not sufficient to retain the current range of services provided by 'L' Division. The *Review* was advised that such determinations will be established at Divisional level in consultation with PSC.

(ii) Pension Adjustments

The possible amalgamation of municipal agencies will create two scenarios which may impact pensions

- melding of municipal pension plans, or
- the change to provincial employment and relevant pension plan

Consequently, there will be a need to be cognizant of pension implications. As above, the *Review* examined the plan rules for the various plans. A summary of the plan rules is included in Appendix B.

If a decision is made to transfer the pension plans for municipal police officers currently participating in the three municipal plans to a provincial plan, there will be a number of significant considerations including:

⁶In 2002, through a Provincial Order in Council, the Victoria and Esquimalt Police Departments (BC) were amalgamated into a regional police service serving the two municipalities; the municipalities established a joint-funding agreement not involving the province, and the staff became employees of the new joint police board

- Negotiating pension transfer agreements between the various pension plans
- Funding any unfunded pension liabilities prior to the transfer as determined by an actuarial evaluation
- Determining the cost implications to the municipalities for differences as a result of indexing, contribution rates, bridge and other benefits
- Determining how best to approach the Kensington RRSP Plan and the cost implications to the Town of Kensington of a defined benefit pension plan
- Assisting the impacted employees in understanding any difference between the plans and the impact on them personally. This will involve the use of pension experts. For example:
 - There may be situations where the acquired pension credits as a result of a transfer may not be equivalent to the exporting employer's pension credits especially if the benefit formula is lower. The reverse may also be true.
 - There are differences as to when an employee can collect an unreduced pension.
 - There are differences in indexing, contribution rates, bridging and other benefits including whether the benefit is guaranteed or dependent on the funding available in the plan.
 - There may be differences in the pension amounts at retirement because the multiplying factors differ between the plans.
 - Differences in the plan rules may impact some employees to a greater extent than others based on career earnings and years of service.

(iii) Facilities

The RCMP Division HQ building in Charlottetown is scheduled for replacement. Currently, there are three separate police facilities in Charlottetown. There is the opportunity for economies of scale by developing a joint facility for the Division and the Charlottetown PS and, if the model is expanded, other municipal police agencies. There is a precedent for this arrangement. Selected functions of the RCMP in Halifax are conducted within the Halifax Regional Police (HRP) facility.

The combined OCC in the new facility will accommodate the new arrangement. However, the Review was informed that even with current space and the limited need for expanded facilities versus changes in personnel and process, the current RCMP Divisional facility can accommodate a combined OCC. Following a review conducted in 2008⁷, in Halifax the RCMP and the HRP have a combined OCC.

(iv) Role of Atlantic Police Academy (APA)

Although located in PEI, the local graduations from the APA police studies program comprise only a small percentage of the total Atlantic provinces graduates.

The APA will continue to perform the same training functions under the Newfoundland model. Given the development of the appropriate business case, the APA may also be able to attract training of RCMP and other federal departments.

⁷ perivale+taylor, 2008

(v) Change Plan

The implementation will require a one year to eighteen-month time frame, during which time the following standardizations, essential in all plans for moving forward, will be completed:

- security clearances
- common Island-wide OCC, CAD, RMS
- integrated Island-wide investigative teams
- pension plan transitions
- other more strategic elements, such as building plans, will require a longer time span

(vi) Provincial Management

With regards the RCMP, the current process would continue, the Commanding Officer reporting to the Minister under the PPSA which may be amended for the new model. The Chief Officer of the provincial police would be selected by, and also report to, the Minister. The *Phase 1 Review Report* discussed the option of a Board to oversee policing under the authority of the Minister.

It is envisioned that the equivalent of two FTEs plus specialized expert advice would be required for the first year for the implementation process and one FTE thereafter. Contracted specialized advice will be required for employment law and pension matters and, possibly, IT. This resource requirement may be impacted by the establishment of a Board. The *Review* was advised that under both the Territorial and the Newfoundland models, one FTE was assigned for management. This was considered barely adequate to manage the ongoing established management process.

A.1.2 Findings

Should the Government desire to migrate to the Integrated Newfoundland Model the following could be contemplated and proposed outcomes would be realized,

- The three existing police departments could be dissolved through a ministerial order and the new PEI police agency established.
- the new agency may be provincial police similar to the Newfoundland Constabulary, or an amalgamated municipal police similar to the Victoria and Esquimalt Police
- The continuation of the current municipal-provincial policing boundaries will make implementation easier.
- As discussed in the Report of Phase 1, the Integrated Newfoundland model provides a cohesive and integrated governance model through a common reporting point for both the RCMP Division and the new agency.
- A process would have to be developed to select qualified leadership for the new organization.
- Unified Crime- and Incident-analyses functions will be required between the two police agencies.
- Negotiation will be required with the municipalities and bargaining units regarding employment status of current municipal employees.
- Integrated centralized or regionalized specialist teams will support the RCMP detachments and police department.

Appendix B Supplemental Work on the Phase 1 Report

Following senior discussion, a number of side issues were mentioned and the following briefing paper was submitted by *perivale + taylor* in August 2016, clarifying these questions regarding the recommended 'tiered approach' of policing services, community policing, the Atlantic Police Academy, and policing affordability.

FOLLOW-UP BRIEFING PAPER

1 Introduction

On 26 July 2016, Perivale and Taylor Consulting (*perivale + taylor*) presented to Cabinet the findings of the *Crime Prevention and Police Model Review* (the *Review*) 2016. The *Review* was based upon the requirement for *cohesive, integrated, and efficient public safety services*.⁸ The analysis, supported by a best practices review, resulted in seventeen recommendations to enhance the policing of the Island. The *Report* described six police models which are extant in Canada, including the PEI *status quo*, and examined each against the required criteria, three of which could be consistent with the concept of integrated, cohesive, and efficient. Two of those models were thought by Cabinet to be more feasible for the Island, the 'Yukon' and the 'Newfoundland' models.

During the Cabinet discussion, a number of side issues were mentioned and this paper provides brief responses to these questions.

- I. A tiered approach to community safety which permits, possibly, the engagement of personnel with various levels of competencies and skills to address different aspects of the policing task.
- II. A focus upon 'community policing' such that the representatives of the police agency are present and visible in the community.
- III. A role for the Atlantic Police Academy.
- IV. Strategies within the models which facilitate 'affordability', especially large events such as the Cavendish Festival.

2 Implementation

Although not directly linked to the models themselves, with any new Island-wide structural policing model these, and similar, issues will be addressed by the implementation plan.

3 Clarification

The following sections describe potential approaches to address the above issues.

⁸ Mandate letter to the Minister

3.1 Tiered Approach

Although tiered policing exists on the Island, there is no formal or legislated requirements for how secondary or tertiary levels of service are provided strategically. Any new arrangement (model) should establish policies and protocols for delivering services in the most effective and efficient manner, whether delivered by RCMP, municipal, or integrated teams.

Tier one is delivered by local police, whether municipal or RCMP, comprising first response, primary investigation, and crime prevention and road safety initiatives. This tier may also include other types of services as described in 3.2 below.

The secondary tier compromises specialized functions, with appropriate training and experience, to assist the local police: forensics, canine, tactical, major case management,⁹ sexual assault investigation, and other crimes requiring specialized resources. The new model will ensure such services are available Island-wide regardless of the service provider.

The tertiary level includes off-Island support for major events or serious crimes, as well as federal policing provided by the RCMP.

3.2 Community Policing

Many of *perivale + taylor's* policing reviews identified a community desire for the memory of 'the beat cop', the person who seemed always to be around, and was known by name to most of the community. Other than busy areas, Canadian 'beat cops' are now few. Complexity of investigations has taken more police resources for the same number of incidents; new approaches and crimes have claimed resources. Crimes such as cyber-crime, Internet luring, child pornography, family violence, elder abuse; and mental health, homelessness, and addiction issues absorb police resources.

A different type of officer may be used to complement the police service in providing the local and familiar police presence. In the UK, Police Community Support Officers (PCSO) provide a primary level of police contact and service.¹⁰ PCSOs have different roles in different forces, but they usually patrol a beat and interact with the public, while also offering assistance to police officers at crime scenes and major events.

Depending on the local police force policies, PCSOs may:

- deal with minor offences
- offer early intervention to deter people from committing offences
- provide support for front-line policing
- conduct house-to-house enquiries
- guard crime scenes
- provide crime prevention advice

⁹ Major Case Management is a trained and certified process involving a commander, lead investigator, analyst, investigative team, and disclosure/file coordinator. The Canadian Police College provides training and certification

¹⁰ UK Police website

The Vancouver (BC) Police Department utilizes Community Safety personnel. They have restricted peace officer status, but are not police officers, and assist regular patrol officers with various tasks, including picking up statements, outside perimeter security at police incidents, and assisting with the transportation and tagging of property. In addition, they will be available to provide logistical support during large-scale deployments, major events, emergencies or disasters.¹¹

The RCMP has initiated a number of Community Safety Officer(CSO)pilot programs based on the objective to contribute to safer homes and communities through visible, accessible, policing and crime prevention services. However, the program was discontinued in 2014.¹² A modified CSO program is apparently being developed.

In Saskatoon, five uniformed CSOs provide foot patrol within the three Business Improvement Districts attending a variety of calls for services including incidents related to:

- Addictions
- Minor Disturbances
- Individuals requiring access to shelter and/or nutrition
- Suspicious persons & loitering
- Individuals exhibiting behaviours typical of those dealing with mental illness
- Providing directions and business information
- Facilitate partnerships with local businesses, residents and community support organizations in order to identify potential issues and areas of concern
- Person injured or in need of ambulance/medical attention where it is not a result of criminal conduct
- Attend special events and functions ¹³

The Atlantic Police Academy provides a Sheriff and Public Safety Officer training program, described under the following section.

The rationalization of policing services should include the introduction of a CSO-type concept for the Island.

3.3 Atlantic Police Academy (APA)¹⁴

In association with Holland College, the Canadian Centre of Public Safety Excellence offer five programs: Basic Firefighting, Conservation Enforcement, Correctional Officer, Police Science (Cadet), and Sheriff and Public Safety Officer. The Police Academy is one of six national police training academies recognized by the Canadian Association Chiefs of Police (CACP) and the Canadian Professional Police Association (CPPA). The Police Science (Cadet) Program is 35 weeks in duration and graduates can then apply for employment in Canadian police agencies.

The Academy enables graduates to utilize their certificate towards credits in a Bachelor of Arts degree, at Holland College, at the University of Prince Edward Island, and the University of Cape

¹¹ VPD website

¹² RCMP website

¹³ Found at <http://csosaskatoon.ca/>

¹⁴ perivale + taylor was not requested to conduct a review of the APA

Breton.¹⁵ The Centre also provides Conservation Officer training, including 12 PEI students from 2011-2015 of a total of 99 students.¹⁶

In-service police training includes courses in Basic Enforcement, Investigations, Supervision, Management as well as hard skills training on Judgmental Use of Force, Firearms, Driver Training.¹⁷ The most recent annual police-related in-service training included 215 candidates, 126 of which were from PEI police.¹⁸ The majority of Maritime police hires are graduates of the APA.¹⁹ The table below illustrates the comparative hiring ratios of the three provinces.

Maritime Municipal Police Staffing ²⁰			
Prince Edward Island	97	Three police departments	6.9%
Nova Scotia	863	Ten PDs ²¹	61.8%
New Brunswick	437	Nine PDs ²²	31.3%
	1397 ²³		100%

The small percentage of Island municipal police compared to the Maritimes indicates that a loss of recruit training would have a minor impact on the APA (less than 7%).

The APA faces a challenge in having to charge fees for training. Training provided by 'L' Division for both RCMP and municipal staff is provided at no cost - notwithstanding that the province pays for 70% of 'L' Division. During the *Review* interviews, it was mentioned that local agencies don't have the funding to cover these costs and consequently they usually use the train-the-trainers concept. In a strategic approach, it would be logical to be able to use the APA as a regional centre, reducing costs and travel time for Summerside and the west Island.

In addition, the Academy provides a Sheriff and Public Safety Officer training program. This could provide a foundation for an Island solution to the concept of community safety officers providing a role in local policing, described in 3.2 above.

3.4 Policing Affordability

When adjusting for inflation, police spending increased annually from 1997/1998 and 2010/2011. Since then, operating expenditures have remained relatively stable and were

¹⁵ APA website June 2016

¹⁶ APA Conservation Enforcement Student List

¹⁷ APA Canadian Centre of Public Safety Excellence (CCPSE) Report June 2016

¹⁸ APA In-Service Training Report April 1 2015 - March 31 2016. Others included Nova Scotia, New Brunswick, and non-police included sheriffs and military. The 2014-2015 report included 75 PEI police, and the 2013-2014 report 26

¹⁹ perivale + taylor interviews previous Maritime reviews and Halifax Police and Charlottetown police websites

²⁰ Note: The Royal Newfoundland Constabulary (RNC) training consists of two academic semesters at the Memorial University followed by a practical training semester at the RNC in St. John's. Found at RNC website <http://www.rnc.gov.nl.ca/careers/training.html>

²¹ Nova Scotia Justice

²² New Brunswick Department of Public Safety

²³ Staffing figures from Statistics Canada Police Resources in Canada 2015

unchanged in 2014/2015. When accounting for population, police expenditures decreased from \$315 per capital in 2013/2014 to \$312 in 2014/2015 (-0.9%).²⁴

However, policing costs are an on-going concern of provinces and municipalities. Internally, police agencies have largely implemented 'civilianization' of functions not requiring the training and powers of the constable; achieving cost savings and improved performance.

An area being explored is the concept of moving public safety tasks to other agencies; the example of CSO is described above. In addition, the use of private security provides an opportunity for addressing specific safety issues more cost efficiently.

The Law Commission of Canada noted

It is becoming increasingly difficult to clearly define the roles and responsibilities of private security and public police. While there remain distinct tasks that are handled solely by one or the other, the task of "policing" and securing society carried out by a network of public police and private security is often overlapping, complimentary and mutually supportive.²⁵

The Expert Panel on the Future of Canadian Policing Models described the concept of the public safety and security web

comprising an increasing number of non-police organizations — including private security — that now interact with one another and with police in the provision of safety and security.²⁶

Private security services provide an opportunity to address public safety issues in a task-specific and event-specific and cost-effective manner.

In Vancouver, 'Ambassadors' assist the Vancouver Police Department by alerting the police to suspicious activity or crimes that have already occurred or that may occur and recovering stolen property, and they check on the welfare of street involved people between 50-150 times per month. They direct homeless people to resources and shelters and provide snacks. They provide warm clothing in the winter and hydration during hot weather. The Ambassadors are trained certified in basic security training under the BC Security Services Act.²⁷

We all have a role to play in keeping our communities safe and welcoming. The DVBA's Downtown Ambassadors have been an important partner of the VPD's for years. The department relies on their dedicated service to be additional 'eyes and ears' on our streets to keep our community safe and to report crimes. We have been impressed with the Ambassadors' professionalism, compassion and enthusiastic interest in making our city more inviting for all who live here and visit."

²⁴ Statistics Canada Police Resources in Canada 2015

²⁵ Law Commission of Canada 2006 found at Statistics Canada

²⁶ Policing Canada in the 21st century: new Policing for new challenges. The Expert Panel on the Future of Canadian Policing Models 2014, page xi, found at http://www.scienceadvice.ca/uploads/eng/assessments%20and%20publications%20and%20news%20releases/policing/policing_fullreporten.pdf

²⁷ Interviews and found at <https://www.downtownvancouver.net/about/activities-of-the-dvbia/downtown-ambassadors>

*Jim Chu
Former Chief Constable
Vancouver Police Department*

In a parallel Vancouver initiative, since 1998, the Downtown Vancouver Business Improvement Association has had a dedicated staff person responsible for Crime Prevention Services. Currently a Security Consultant oversees the Loss Prevention Team Program and numerous other initiatives. The Loss Prevention Program is comprised of six full-time Loss Prevention Specialists who are trained to protect members and their property from theft and vandalism. Specific areas of focus are retail stores, office towers, hotels, parkades and public events.²⁸ The Loss Prevention Team members are trained and certified in private security and also as private investigators under the *Security Services Act*.

Increased cost effectiveness of policing services can be enhanced by an integrated and cohesive approach involving the CSO approach and utilizing private security (including the Corps of Commissionaires). The Report of the Review recommends an enhanced private security presence on the Island.

The Law Commission of Canada made the following recommendation:

*Public Security Boards or analogous institutions should have the ability to allocate their budget to providers of policing, whether public or private, according to their demonstrated capacity and suitability for contributing to the best overall policing of communities.*²⁹

For example, a troubling trend of commercial break-ins in a business area could be addressed by a plan involving both police and private security. Private Security personnel could also be trained in traffic control to assist at major but infrequent events such as the Cavendish Festival. Minor nuisances could be patrolled by private security, and the protection of crime scenes also.

Such initiatives would create cost savings and free police for matters more fitted to their mandate.

4 Conclusion

Whatever model of Island policing is pursued, the above features should be part of the strategic approach to integrated, cohesive, and efficient services. Recommendations in this vein were made in the *Report of the Review*.

²⁸ Interviews and found at <https://www.downtownvancouver.net/about/activities-of-the-dvbia/crime-prevention>

²⁹ In Search of Security: The Future of Policing in Canada Law Commission of Canada 2006

Appendix C Pension Issues

Summary

	RCMP Plan	PEI Fund	Kensington RRSP	Summerside Plan	Charlottetown Plan
Defined Benefit	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	yes
Factor under AMPE	1.375%	1.3%	N/A	2%	2%
Factor over AMPE	2%	2%	N/A	2%	2%
Salary Factor	5 Year Highest Average Salary	Indexed Career Average Salary	N/A	Best 3 Years	Best 3 Years
Years Factor	Maximum 35 years of Pensionable Service	Maximum 35 years of Pensionable Service	N/A	Maximum 35 years of Pensionable Service	Maximum 35 years of Pensionable Service
Bridge Benefit	Yes	Yes	N/A	Tied to Funding and ranking of Benefit Priorities	No
Indexing	Yes	Tied to Plan Funding	N/A	Tied to Funding and ranking of Benefit Priorities	Tied to Plan Funding
Unreduced Pension	Age 60	Lesser of age 60 or 30 or more years' service until 2019 then lesser age (at age 55 or older)	N/A	Lesser of Age 60, 30 years of service or age plus service = 80 or age plus service = 85	Lesser of Age 60, 30 years of service or age plus service = 80 or age plus service = 85
Contribution Rates – Employee and Employer	9.05% up to AMPE and 11.04% over AMPE	Employee rates from 7.09% - 10.75% and employer rates from 4.09% and 13.75% depending on salary levels and funding status of the plan	Maximum 5% voluntary for employees matched by employer	11%	Not to exceed the lesser of 9% of \$1,000 and 70% of the total of all pension credits of the Member

3.1 Kensington

The pension benefit for the Kensington Municipal Police is covered under Article 32 – Retirement Contributions of the Collective Agreement between the Town of Kensington and the Canadian Union of Public Employees (CUPE) Local 4893. The plan entitles all full-time employees to voluntarily contribute up to 5% of their wages to a Registered Retirement Savings Plan (RRSP) which will be matched by the employer. When the employee retires, they are entitled to the sum of employee and employer contributions and any investment earnings the RRSP plan has accumulated at the time of retirement. There is no guarantee of a benefit amount.

Issues for Kensington include:

- As the RRSP plan is voluntary, there are likely officers who have chosen not to participate.
- The cost of the benefit plans to both the employer and the employee will be significantly higher than under their current RRSP Plan. For example, currently the employee contributions into the RCMP pension plan is 9.05% up to \$54,900 in earnings and 11.04% for amounts over \$54,900 in earnings. The PEI Civil Service Superannuation Fund (PEI Plan) range from employee contributions of 7.09% to 10.75% and employer contributions of 4.09% to 13.75% depending on salary levels and the funding status of the PEI Plan.
- Indexing would also have cost implications. The RCMP Pension Plan is fully indexed to take into account any increases in the cost of living. The PEI Fund removed the guaranteed inflation protection in 2014 and replaced it with a rules-based formula which provides inflation protection dependent on the funded status of the Plan.
- The RCMP Pension Plan will consider the negotiation of a Pension Transfer Agreement (PTA) to provide pensionable service with an outside employer when an employee leaves the outside employment to become employed as a member of the RCMP. As an RRSP plan does not calculate pensionable service, there may be issues for transferring to the RCMP Pension Plan. These same issues would apply to the PEI Fund as well.
- It was noted in the Collective Agreement between the Town of Kensington and CUPE that both parties agreed to a presentation on the CUPE Multi Section Pension Plan. It is therefore likely to be considered a positive outcome for the Kensington employee to be part of a defined benefit plan even if the pensionable service calculation begins on day one of the transfer to the plan. The employee would still have the value of the RRSP and would not experience any diminution in entitlement under the existing Collective Agreement.

3.2 Charlottetown and Summerside

The Municipal Police working for the City of Charlottetown are covered under the City of Charlottetown Superannuation Plan (the Charlottetown Plan) and the Municipal Police working for the City of Summerside are covered under the City of Summerside Employees' Pension Plan (the Summerside Plan). Both municipalities provide defined pension benefit plans to their employees. The Pension Benefit Calculations vary between the two municipalities, the RCMP Plan and the PEI Fund.

The RCMP Plan offers an unreduced pension at age 60. The PEI Fund offers an unreduced pension after attaining 32 or more years of service (while being at least 55 years of age) or attaining the age of 62. The Charlottetown Plan offers an unreduced pension at the earliest of

age 60, 30 years of service Pensionable Service, if greater, or the date upon which the Member's age plus years of Service or Pensionable Service, if greater, total 80. The Plan allows for an unreduced pension if age plus service equals 85. The Summerside Plan offers an unreduced pension at the earliest of age 60, 30 years of service or the date upon which the Member's age plus years of service total 80. These differences could impact an employee's retirement date or pension calculation.

The RCMP and the PEI Fund are very similar in their pension calculations using different multiplying factors under and over the Annual Maximum Pension Earning (AMPE). The RCMP Plan uses Highest Average Salary for 5 consecutive years of highest paid service while the PEI Plan uses an indexed Career Average Salary.

Charlottetown and Summerside Pension Plans are very similar to each other using a 2% multiplying factor and the Best Three Years of Remuneration.

The reduction in the multiplier for remuneration under the AMPE would result in a lower pension calculation for the municipal employees to transfer to either the RCMP Plan or the PEI Fund. The impact of the salary multiplier might also reduce the pension amount for the municipal employees in a transfer.

All plans restrict the calculation to a maximum of 35 years of service.

The RCMP Plan offers full indexing to recognize changes in the Consumer Price Index (CPI) each year. The PEI plan does not guarantee indexing to retirees. Granting of indexing is dependent on the funded status of the plan and when funded is based on a maximum of 100% of the increase in the Average Industrial Wage (AIW). Both Summerside and Charlottetown offer indexing; however, Summerside ties Ancillary Benefit improvements such that the Commuted Value of the improved entitlement is equal to the Cash Value of Benefits (Ancillary Benefits are prioritized and ranked). Charlottetown ties the rate to the average of the yields of five-year personal fixed term chartered bank deposit rates over the preceding twelve-month period and indexing is tied to available funding.

The RCMP Plan and the PEI fund provide for a bridge benefit for those who retire before age 65 and are not receiving Canada Pension Plan (CPP) or Quebec Pension Plan (QPP). The Summerside Plan ties the bridge benefit to funding and a prioritization of ancillary benefits.

Contribution rates differ between the plans. As noted above, the employee contributions into the RCMP pension plan is 9.05% up to \$54,900 in earnings and 11.04% for amounts over \$54,900 in earnings. The PEI Civil Service Superannuation Fund (PEI Plan) range from employee contributions of 7.09% to 10.75% and employer contributions of 4.09% to 13.75% depending on salary levels and the funding status of the PEI Plan. The Summerside Plan's current contribution rates are 11% for both employer and employee. The Charlottetown Plan's contribution rates as set out in the most current version of the Plan are set to not exceed the lesser of 9% of \$1,000 and 70% of the total of all Pension Credits of the member.

The RCMP Plan allows for transfer of accrued pension benefits from other pension plans to the RCMP Plan through the signing of a Pension Transfer Agreement (PTA). Requests are reviewed through a special unit called the RCMP Pension Transfer Agreement Unit. If there are periods of service not covered by the transfer, there is a possibility for the employee to purchase service.

The PEI Plan does not currently have reciprocal transfer agreements with Kensington, Summerside or Charlottetown. There is no mention of reciprocal arrangement with other pension plans in the Summerside Plan. The Charlottetown Plan contemplates reciprocal agreements with the Government of Canada and the Government of Prince Edward Island.

The City of Summerside recently raised the contribution rates for both the employee and the employer because of a deficit of \$4.7 million as at the end of 2012. The article in The Guardian noted that the Summerside Plan had been hit hard by a sluggish marketplace and changing employee trends. Actuarial assessments will be necessary to determine whether unfunded pension liabilities exist at the time of transfer for both municipalities.

3.3 Pension Plan Rules

Below are the Lifetime Pension Benefit Calculations for the various plans. To simplify the considerations, the calculations for a reduced pension for early retirement are not shown.

3.3.1 The Royal Canadian Mounted Police Pension Plan (the RCMP Plan):

*Highest Average Salary is the average annual salary of 5 consecutive years of highest paid service.

*AMPE is a Canada Pension Plan term that stands for Annual Maximum Pensionable Earnings and is equal to \$54,900 for 2016.

1.375% x Highest Average Salary up to the AMPE x Years of Pensionable Service (maximum 35 years)

Plus

2% x Highest Average Salary in excess of the AMPE x Years of Pensionable Service (maximum 35 years)

The RCMP Plan provides a bridge benefit for those who retire before age 65 and are not receiving CPP or QPP.

The RCMP Plan allows for full indexing set to the Consumer Price Index (CPI).

Employee/Employer contributions are cost shared on a 50/50 basis. Current employee contributions are 9.05% up to \$54,900 and 11.04% in excess of \$54,900.

The Plan contemplates reciprocal agreements with other pension plans.

3.3.2 Prince Edward Island Civil Superannuation Fund (the PEI Fund)

*Indexed Career Average Salary means the average of all earnings after the indexation has been applied over the course of the career of the member while in the Plan.

*YMPE is a Canada Pension Plan term that stands for Yearly Maximum Pensionable Earnings and is equal to \$54,900 for 2016.

1.3 % x Indexed Career Average Salary up to the YMPE x Years of Pensionable Service

Plus

2% x Indexed Career Average Salary in excess of the YMPE x Years of Pensionable Service

The PEI Fund provides a bridge benefit for those who retire before age 65 and are not receiving CPP or QPP.

Indexing is dependent on the funded status of the Plan.

Employee/Employer contributions are cost shared on a 50/50 basis. Current employee contribution rates range from 7.09% and 10.75% and employer contribution rates range from 4.09% and 13.75% depending on salary levels and the funding status of the Plan.

The Plan does not currently have reciprocal transfer agreements with Kensington, Summerside or Charlottetown.

3.3.4 The Town of Kensington Registered Retirement Savings Plan (the RRSP Plan)

The Pension benefit is dependent upon the amount of funds available in the RRSP Plan including investment returns and the contributions by the employer and employee. The RRSP Plan entitles all full-time employees to voluntarily contribute up to 5% of their wages into the Plan which is matched by the employer.

3.3.5 The City of Summerside Employees' Pension Plan (the Summerside Plan)

The calculations for pension entitlement for employees of the Summerside Municipality is complicated and includes calculations depending on when an employee worked for the Municipality. The following is a simplification of the rules and will vary by officer:

2% x Average of the Best Three Consecutive Years Remuneration x Years of Pensionable Service (maximum 35 years) plus the amount which can be provided by the Accumulated Value of any additional voluntary contributions made by the member.

Voluntary Contributions when combined with the required contributions cannot exceed the maximum permitted under the Income Tax Act.

Early retirement provides a temporary bridging benefit payable to the maximum levels permitted under the Income Tax Act.

The Plan allows for indexing at the lower of the CPI and 3%.

Both the bridging and indexing benefits are granted such that the Commuted Value of the entitlement is equal to the Cash Value of the Benefits. Ancillary Benefits are ranked by funding priority, and the Member has no choice in the improvement of Ancillary Benefits.

Employee/Employer contributions are cost shared on a 50/50 basis. Current contribution rates are 11% for both employee and employer.

There is no mention of reciprocal arrangements with other pension plans in the plan rules.

3.3.6 The City of Charlottetown Superannuation Plan (the Charlottetown Plan)

*The Charlottetown Plan has, at the election of a Member, an option to use $2\% \times \text{Average Annualized Salary of the Member for any 10 Successive years} \times \text{Years of Pensionable Service}$ (maximum 35 years) in respect of Service prior to January 1, 1992.

Otherwise, the calculation is:

$2\% \times \text{Average Annualized Salary of the Member for the Best 3 Years} \times \text{Years of Pensionable Service}$ (maximum 35 years)

The Plan allows for indexing through application of the excess interest method which considers the funded status of the Plan and CPI.

The Plan does not provide for a bridge benefit for those who retire before age 65 and are not receiving CPP or QPP.

Employee/Employer contributions are cost shared on a 50/50 basis. Contribution rates as set out in the most current version of the Plan are set to not exceed the lesser of 9% or the total of \$1,000 and 70% of the total of all Pension Credits of the member.

The Plan contemplates reciprocal agreements with the Government of Canada and the Government of Prince Edward Island.